



Bonneagar Iompair Éireann
Transport Infrastructure Ireland

TII Publications



Project Appraisal Guidelines for National Roads Unit 9.0 - Post Project Review

PE-PAG-02034
October 2016

Withdrawn

About TII

Transport Infrastructure Ireland (TII) is responsible for managing and improving the country's national road and light rail networks.

About TII Publications

TII maintains an online suite of technical publications, which is managed through the TII Publications website. The contents of TII Publications is clearly split into 'Standards' and 'Technical' documentation. All documentation for implementation on TII schemes is collectively referred to as TII Publications (Standards), and all other documentation within the system is collectively referred to as TII Publications (Technical).

Document Attributes

Each document within TII Publications has a range of attributes associated with it, which allows for efficient access and retrieval of the document from the website. These attributes are also contained on the inside cover of each current document, for reference.

TII Publication Title	<i>Project Appraisal Guidelines for National Roads Unit 9.0 - Post Project Review</i>
TII Publication Number	<i>PE-PAG-02034</i>

Activity	<i>Planning & Evaluation (PE)</i>	Document Set	<i>Technical</i>
Stream	<i>Project Appraisal Guidelines (PAG)</i>	Publication Date	<i>October 2016</i>
Document Number	<i>02034</i>	Historical Reference	PAG Unit 9.0

TII Publications Website

This document is part of the TII publications system all of which is available free of charge at <http://www.tiipublications.ie>. For more information on the TII Publications system or to access further TII Publications documentation, please refer to the TII Publications website.

TII Authorisation and Contact Details

This document has been authorised by the Director of Professional Services, Transport Infrastructure Ireland. For any further guidance on the TII Publications system, please contact the following:

Contact: Standards and Research Section, Transport Infrastructure Ireland
 Postal Address: Parkgate Business Centre, Parkgate Street, Dublin 8, D08 DK10
 Telephone: +353 1 646 3600
 Email: infoPUBS@tii.ie

TII Publications



Activity:	Planning & Evaluation (PE)
Stream:	Project Appraisal Guidelines (PAG)
TII Publication Title:	Project Appraisal Guidelines for National Roads Unit 9.0 - Post Project Review
TII Publication Number:	PE-PAG-02034
Publication Date:	October 2016
Set:	Technical

Contents Table

Withdrawn

1. Introduction	1
2. Project Management	2
3. Project Conception	3
4. Project Planning.....	4
4.1 Traffic Analysis and Projections.....	4
4.2 Option Selection	4
4.3 Project Appraisal.....	4
4.4 Planning and Design.....	4
4.5 Procurement & Statutory Process.....	4
4.6 Consultation.....	4
5. Project Implementation.....	5
5.1 Project Management.....	5
5.2 Project Scope, Value and Risk Management	5
5.3 Form of Contract.....	5
6. Project Operational Performance	6
6.1 Operational Performance.....	6
7. Focus of the Review.....	7
8. Handover, Review & Closeout Cost Benefit Analysis.....	8
8.1 Comparison with Previous CBA.....	8
9. Contents and Structure of the Post Project Review Report	9

1. Introduction

At the completion of any project, it is a requirement of the TII Project Management Guidelines (PMG) that a Project Closeout Report be prepared. The Project Closeout Report verifies that all aspects of the project have been completed, confirms project budget information and discusses the issues that arose in project development, particularly those that have implications for future road planning and implementation.

The Department of Public Expenditure and Reform (DPER)¹ and the Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport (DTTAS)² indicate that in addition to the Project Closeout Report, a Post Project Review should be carried out for all projects costing in excess of €20 million, and for a representative sample of 5 per cent of all projects under €20m. The aim of the review is to determine whether:

- The basis on which a project was undertaken proved correct;
- The expected benefits and outcomes materialised;
- The planned outcomes were the appropriate responses to actual public needs;
- The appraisal and management procedures adopted were satisfactory, and
- Conclusions can be drawn applicable to other projects, to the ongoing use of the asset, or to associated policies.

The Post Project Review thus incorporates elements of the Project Closeout Report, but extends beyond that report to consider the full range of issues identified above.

¹ The Public Spending Code. Expenditure Planning, Appraisal & Evaluation in the Irish Public Service (DPER, 2013)

² Common Appraisal Framework for Transport Projects and Programmes (DTTAS, 2016)

2. Project Management

The responsibility for the Post Project Review rests with the Sponsoring Agency. The Post Project Review should be carried out by either an employee of the Design Office or a consultant appointed by the Design Team. The person(s) undertaking the Post Project Review should not have been directly involved in the oversight of the project planning or implementation, or in the appraisal of the project.

The Common Appraisal Framework states that a Post Project Review should be undertaken once sufficient time has elapsed to allow the project to be properly evaluated with sufficient evidence of the flow of benefits and costs from it.

It is envisaged that, except in special circumstances, the Post Project Review should be undertaken 5 years after project opening. This timing ensures that the project outturn costs should be known and that experience of the operation of the road and of the traffic volumes arising is available to inform the analysis.

The Post Project Review should evaluate the following four stages of the project:

1. Project Conception;
2. Project Planning;
3. Project Implementation, and
4. Project Operational Performance.

Withdrawn

3. Project Conception

This part of the review should provide an account of the background to the project, how the project arose and reference relevant road or transport programmes or policies. It should then consider the Project Brief and review its comprehensiveness and relevance. In particular, it should assess whether the need for the project was soundly established within the brief and whether the objectives were clearly specified.

Withdrawn

4. Project Planning

The review should address the following aspects of project planning:

4.1 Traffic Analysis and Projections

- Transport modelling approach was appropriate to the nature of the project;
- Projected traffic growth rates were benchmarked against recent trends;
- Projected traffic growth rates were compatible with TII guidelines or other planning documents; and
- The sensitivity of traffic projections to relevant factors was considered.

4.2 Option Selection

- The options considered were sufficiently different to offer real choices;
- The project appraisal processes were fully complied with at Option Selection stage; and
- Appropriate weighting was given to the different impacts of the project in making choices.

4.3 Project Appraisal

- Project appraisal was carried at all the relevant project phases;
- Relevant appraisal techniques / software were used (TUBA, COBALT or other TII accepted techniques);
- Appropriate application rules and parameter values as per DPER, DTTAS and TII guidelines were used, and
- Sensitivity testing was undertaken.

4.4 Planning and Design

- Road capacity decisions had a sound basis;
- The preliminary design proved to be a sound basis for project implementation; and
- Ad-hoc alterations to the design were necessary during the implementation phase and whether these reflected on the quality of the preliminary design process.

4.5 Procurement & Statutory Process

- EU and national rules were adhered to; and
- Compliance with procurement, EIS/EAR and other statutory requirements.

4.6 Consultation

- Consultation processes were of good quality.

5. Project Implementation

With regard to project implementation, the Post Project Review should address the following:

5.1 Project Management

- Project management was in line with the existing TII guidance;
- Monitoring reports were timely and of good quality;
- The project remained within budget;
- The project met target costs;
- The project met the target schedule; and
- The project design requirements were fully met.

5.2 Project Scope, Value and Risk Management

- Active management of scope changes was undertaken;
- Risk management was actively pursued throughout the planning and implementation phases; and
- Opportunities for value management were identified and actively pursued.

5.3 Form of Contract

- Contract obligations were met; and
- Any contractual claims made

6. Project Operational Performance

This section of the Post Project Review should consider:

6.1 Operational Performance

- The project objectives were met;
- Post opening traffic volumes are in line with those predicted and used in the project appraisal;
- Any departure of traffic volumes from those predicted has implications for the predicted economic return to the project;
- There are any problems with traffic operation on the road;
- There are any road safety problems emerging; and
- There are any further actions necessary to secure the anticipated benefits of the project

Withdrawn

7. Focus of the Review

With regard to each of the project phases, the Post Project Review should concentrate on:

- Confirming that all phases of project planning and implementation complied with relevant DTTAS and TII guidelines;
- Confirming that necessary approvals were obtained from TII at appropriate project planning decision points;
- Assessing whether the project has delivered and is likely to continue to deliver on its objectives;
- Identifying any problems with project planning and implementation and analysing how they arose, and
- Drawing lessons from the project planning and implementation for future management of projects.

Withdrawn

8. Handover, Review & Closeout Cost Benefit Analysis

The undertaking of a Phase 7 Closeout and Review Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) may be required as part of a Post Project Review for a project costing in excess of €20m. The final account / closeout CBA should concentrate on establishing whether the basis on which the costs and benefits attributed towards the scheme at planning stage was correct.

An Appraisal Team within the Design Office or an independent consultant acting on behalf of the sponsoring agent will be responsible for undertaking the Closeout and Review CBA.

Prior to undertaking the review, final outturn scheme costs must be established. After 5 years the majority of the scheme costs should be known to allow a CBA to be undertaken. If a substantial proportion of the costs are still outstanding then the undertaking of a CBA can be postponed with the consent of TII. Costs to be used for the appraisal of Public Private Partnership schemes should be agreed with TII.

The Phase 7 Closeout and Review CBA will require information relating to scheme costs, outturn traffic flows, journey times and collision data. The requirement to collect collision data should be confirmed with TII as it is common practice to use collision recorded over an extended period (3 to 5 years) to reduce the impact of one off events on overall trends. Further details on CBA are provided in PAG Unit 6.1: Guidance on Conducting CBA.

8.1 Comparison with Previous CBA

A comparison should be undertaken with both the Phase 2 Option Selection and Phase 3 Design and Environmental Evaluation CBA outputs. The comparison should look at the overall economic indicators including Present Value of Benefits (PVB), Present Value of Costs (PVC), Net Present Value (NPV), Benefit to Cost Ratio (BCR) and Internal Rate of Return (IRR). A summary table should be produced showing the values, at constant prices, for these indicators at each phase.

9. Contents and Structure of the Post Project Review Report

The Post Project Review report should be arranged in the following chapters which are based around the four stages of the project:

Project Conception

Executive summary

Project Planning

Background to the project.

Traffic analysis and forecasting.

Project appraisal procedures.

Option selection.

Preliminary design.

Procurement and statutory processes.

Project Implementation

Project implementation.

Project Operational Performance

Project operational performance.

Overview of issues arising.

Conclusions and recommendations.

The TII has developed a Post Project Review Report that is available for download from the "Downloads" section of the TII Publications website under section PE-PAG-02034_Unit 9.

Withdrawn

Withdrawn



 Ionad Ghnó Gheata na Páirce,
Stráid Gheata na Páirce,
Baile Átha Cliath 8, D08 DK10, Éire

 www.tii.ie

 +353 (01) 646 3600

 Parkgate Business Centre,
Parkgate Street,
Dublin 8, D08 DK10, Ireland

 info@tii.ie

 +353 (01) 646 3601